
MANAGEMENT REPORT

Date: June 30, 2022
To: Planning and Heritage Sub-committee
From: Alyssa Bridge, Manager of Planning
Report #: PLA22-025
Attachments: Correspondence from HPHA dated April 1, 2022

Title: Heritage Stratford Recommendation Regarding the Intent to Designate 86 John Street South and 90 John Street South under Part IV, Section 29 of the Ontario Heritage Act

Objective: To provide Heritage Stratford's recommendation regarding the proposed intent to designate 86 John Street South and 90 John Street South (Avon Crest) under Part IV, Section 29 of the Ontario Heritage Act.

Background: On November 9, 2021, Heritage Stratford resolved the following:

That Heritage Stratford request that Stratford City Council issue a notice of intention to designate the Avon Crest property, 86 John Street South and 90 John Street South, Stratford ON under Part IV, Section 29 of the Ontario Heritage Act specifically the:

- a) 1891 hospital (Avon Crest), including semi-circular landscaped entrance driveway;
- b) 1910 extension;
- c) 1904 Gardener's cottage; and
- d) 1929 Nurses' residence.

Heritage Stratford has initiated this designation request. The property owner, the Huron Perth Health Alliance (HPHA) objects to the designation under Part IV of the Ontario Heritage Act. A letter from the HPHA outlining their concerns with the request is attached.

At the January 14, 2020, Heritage Stratford meeting the HPHA did a presentation to Heritage Stratford announcing their intention to redevelop the property. The property currently is not designated under the Ontario Heritage Act, is not included on the Municipal Heritage Register and it does not abut any properties designated under the

Ontario Heritage Act. The presentation from the HPHA to Heritage Stratford was solely for information purposes.

On February 3, 2020, the HPHA, which includes Stratford General Hospital, issued a Request for Solutions (RFS) with an aim to facilitate “the development of a new iconic building dedicated to providing healthcare-related services to the city and surrounding communities” on the Avon Crest site. The RFS noted that, “the Hospital and HPHA have not performed any analysis or review of the existing site or building conditions.” The RFS required that, “Careful demolition of the existing building must be considered.” Applications were due to HPHA August 17, 2020. No further action on the RFS has been taken by the HPHA.

Non-Designated Municipal Registry

In 2017, Heritage Stratford engaged the University of Waterloo’s Heritage Resource Centre for the purpose of compiling a list of non-designated properties to be listed on the Municipal Heritage Register. The Heritage Resource Centre reviewed over 600 properties previously assessed and identified the 438 properties deemed to have the highest cultural value or significance. The 438 properties were broken down into three lists that were based on their cultural value and significance. The subject lands were included on the second list.

As outlined by Sections 27(3)-(5) of the Ontario Heritage Act, owners of non-designated properties listed on the Municipal Heritage Register are required to provide the Council of the municipality at least 60 days’ notice if they intend to demolish or remove the building or structure.

On March 10, 2020, Heritage Stratford passed a resolution that Development Services staff commence with the second phase of the non-designated register for the properties identified in the Hamlet and Romeo Wards.

The subject lands were included on this list and are located within the Hamlet Ward. On August 10, 2020, Council adopted a resolution that directed staff to explore various forums available to host an open house, that staff notify the property owners of the Heritage Stratford resolution, that staff host an open house and that following the open house that staff forward a final recommended list of properties to be included on the Municipal Heritage Registry as non-designated properties for Council’s consideration. To date the property owners have not been notified and no further action has been taken. It is anticipated that this project will move forward in 2022.

Location

The subject lands are located on the west side of John Street South and on the north side of West Gore Street and are known municipally as 86 John Street South and 90 John Street South and are legally described as Concession 1 Pt Lot 3 (Geographic Township of Downie) in the City of Stratford. The site comprises the Avon Crest

Location Map- 86 John Street South and 90 John Street South



Property History (prepared by Heritage Stratford)

In 1887 Mayor J.C. MacGregor urged the establishment of a hospital in Stratford. Citing the increasing number of industrial accidents, he recalled sending an injured man to jail, the only place then available for the purpose. A determined group of women responded, organizing a public meeting in November 1888, which resulted in the creation of the City of Stratford General Hospital Trust. Within a month over \$7,000 had been raised, enough to construct a wing and tower of what would be a building capable of expansion. But there was no need for such half-measures. As Nancy Z. Tausky and Lynn D. DiStefano explain in *Victorian Architecture in London and Southwestern Ontario*, "So efficient were the money-raising efforts, complete with bazaars and amateur theatricals, that the \$13,361 structure opened debt-free in 1891." Stratford citizens contributed 75% of those construction costs and city council granted the five acres of land upon which the building stands.

The architect, George F. Durand (1850-1889), first worked for Thomas Fuller (later to become Chief Dominion Architect for the Government of Canada) on the New York State Capital building in Albany. Returning to London, Ontario he led a series of architectural partnerships, building a wide range of buildings in Toronto (Upper Canada College) and across southwestern Ontario. According to the *London Advertiser*, Durand "was acknowledged to be the best architect in the Dominion." Durand, was no stranger to Stratford, having already designed the old Pumphouse (1883, now Gallery Stratford), the Perth County Court House (1886) and the Jail (1886). Stratford General Hospital was Durand's final building. He died before it opened.

Designed in the High Victorian Queen Anne Style, the yellow-brick, symmetrical building originally featured a central tower and protruding bay windows on the side wings. These bays were initially open-air porches, providing convalescing patients with fresh air in summer. With its tower, turrets and chimneys it would have presented a picturesque appearance on John Street, an imposing sight when viewed from the T. J. Dolan parkland below.

The five acres of land granted to the hospital by the city testifies to Stratford's farsightedness in understanding that the hospital would continue to grow. The historic property being recommended for protection, therefore, incorporates the building proper, the landscaped, semi-circular entrance drive, the accumulation of subsequent buildings – including gardener's cottage (1904), three-storey, north wing (1910), and nurses' residence (1929) and the remarkable, unobstructed northern views from Avon Crest to the T. J. Dolan parkland.

Avon Crest was constructed as part of a larger push across the country in the 19th century to build general hospitals in Canada's growing cities, often sited at some distance from the city centre, for the protection of both the patients and the healthy population. According to McGill University Professor Annemarie Adams, an expert on hospital architecture, "From roughly the Crimean War to World War I, hospitals looked

like other reform institutions that featured big, open wards. This is the hospital of Florence Nightingale, where 30-some patients lay in parallel rows of narrow beds. Ventilation, ventilation and ventilation were the three main planning ideas driving the form of this largely philanthropic institution, often called the pavilion plan because the buildings were surrounded by fresh air." Many of these early 19th-century hospitals resembled large country houses. They were rectangular structures with central entries. The typical example was a three-storey building crowned by a classical cupola or a central tower and punctuated by numerous chimneys.

As Stratford's population grew and medicine advanced, Stratford General Hospital was continuously expanded and upgraded – 1904 (gardener's cottage), 1910 (three-storey, north wing), 1915 (electricity), 1917 (telephone), 1920 (x-ray department), 1925 (laboratory) and 1929 (nurses' residence) – until finally, in 1955, it was repurposed as a convalescent facility (Dean Robinson, *For Your Health: Stratford General Hospital 1891-2002*). According to the Stratford Beacon-Herald, "In 1990, all remaining inpatient services offered at Avon Crest were transferred to the Stratford hospital's main campus and, more recently as between two years ago [in 2018], all outpatient and other hospital services, including laundry, were also consolidated in the newer east building, which opened in 2010."

For most of the 19th century nurses had lived in rooms scattered throughout the hospital proper, but in the early 20th-century hospitals began constructing purpose-built nurses' residences, which soon included teaching facilities in addition to individual rooms. Like the Ann Baillie Building, Kingston General Hospital's nurses' residence constructed in 1903 and recognized by the Historic Sites and Monument Board of Canada, Stratford Hospital's 1905 nurses' residence also commemorates the contribution of nurses and nursing to scientific medicine and to women's agency as health care professionals. Such buildings also celebrate and remind us of the training and professionalism of nurses, their social life and unique culture, as they emerged as leaders in the field of medicine.

Hospitals are architectural landmarks, important and sometimes beautiful buildings. When it opened in May 1891, Stratford Hospital was a symbol of progress in science and technology, one that represented Stratfordites' belief in the welfare of all its citizens. Today it is a repository of personal memory and collective social meaning, a place intimately associated with birth, illness and death within our community. Cameron Logan, an expert on hospital architecture and its preservation, believes that, "architects, preservation professionals, and municipal-planning departments must think about hospitals as historic places, whether they want to or not."

George F. Durand's drawings for the Stratford Hospital are preserved as part of the Murphy-Moore collection of architectural records (AFC-47) at the University of Western Ontario.

Sources:

"Ann Baillie Building," National Historic Site of Canada,
<https://www.historicplaces.ca/en/rep-reg/place-lieu.aspx?id=4024&pid=0>

Adams, Annmarie "Canadian hospital architecture: how we got here," CMAJ March 15, 2016 188 (5) 370-371. (<https://www.cmaj.ca/content/188/5/370>)

Adams, Annmarie "Hospital Architecture," The Canadian Encyclopedia
<https://thecanadianencyclopedia.ca/en/article/hospital-architecture>

Baker, M., & Neary, H. 100 fascinating Londoners. Toronto: James Lorimer & Company, 2005.

Crawford, David S. "Histories of Canadian hospitals and schools of nursing,"
<https://internatlibs.mcgill.ca/hospitals/hospital-histories.htm>

"George F. Durand," Biographical Dictionary of Architects in Canada
(<http://dictionaryofarchitectsincanada.org/node/1653>)

RFS T-345 Avon Crest Centre for Health & Wellness. Available at: www.biddingo.com
and www.MERX.com

Robinson, Dean. For Your Health: Stratford General Hospital 1891-2002 (Stratford: Stratford General Hospital, 2003).

Schneider, Dan. "Avon Crest - Stratford's First Hospital at a Crossroads," ACORN (Fall 2014), 18-19.

Simmons, Galen. "Huron Perth Healthcare Alliance seeking redevelopment ideas for Avon Crest property in Stratford," The Beacon Herald, Stratford (Feb 05, 2020),
<https://www.stratfordbeaconherald.com/news/local-news/huron-perth-healthcare-alliance-seeking-redevelopment-ideas-for-avon-crest-property-in-stratford>

Tausky, Nancy Z. and Lynn D. DiStefano. Victorian Architecture in London and Southwestern Ontario: Symbols of Aspiration (Toronto, University of Toronto Press, 1986).

Analysis:

Planning Framework

Planning Act

Section 2 of the Ontario Planning Act identifies the conservation of cultural heritage resources is identified as a Provincial interest and directs that municipalities shall have

regard to the conservation of features of significant architectural, cultural, historical, archaeological, or scientific interest. The conservation of cultural heritage resources contributes to other matters of provincial interest, including the promotion of built form that is well-designed and that encourages a sense of place.

Provincial Policy Statement, 2020

In accordance with the Wise Use and Management of Resources policies in Section 2.6 of the Provincial Policy Statement (PPS) significant built heritage resources and significant cultural heritage landscapes shall be wisely conserved and managed. Built heritage resources are defined in the PPS as a building, structure, monument, installation or any manufactured or constructed part or remnant that contributes to a property's cultural heritage value or interest as identified by a community, including an indigenous community. Built heritage resources are located on a property that may be designated under Part IV or V of the Ontario Heritage Act, or may be included on local, provincial, federal and/or international registers.

City of Stratford Official Plan

Section 3.5.3 of the Stratford Official Plan sets out additional criteria for designation:

- i) The City shall continue to designate by by-law individual properties and groups of properties, as well as cultural heritage landscapes, pursuant to the provisions of the Ontario Heritage Act utilizing criteria for determining heritage value or interest established by provincial regulation under the Ontario Heritage Act and the following municipal criteria:
 - a) prehistoric and historical associations with a theme of human history that is representative of cultural processes in the settlement, development and use of land in the City;
 - b) prehistoric and historical associations with the life and activities of a person, group, institution or organization that has made a significant contribution to the City;
 - c) architectural, engineering, landscape design, physical, craft and/or artistic value;
 - d) scenic amenity with associated views and vistas that provide a recognizable sense of position or place;
 - e) contextual value in defining the historical, visual, scenic, physical and functional character of an area; and,
 - f) landmark value.

The Ontario Heritage Act enables municipalities to identify and protect heritage resources by way of designation under Part IV or Part V of the act. The City of Stratford Official Plan implements key heritage principles and interests set out provincial policy regime of the Planning Act, the Provincial Policy Statement, and the Ontario Heritage Act and provides direction to further identify, protect and manage significant cultural heritage resources within the City. The designation of individual properties under Part IV of the Ontario Heritage Act is one tool that municipalities can utilize to identify and protect heritage cultural resources within the city.

Ontario Heritage Act

Buildings, structures, and landscapes may be designated under Part IV of the Ontario Heritage Act if they meet a minimum of one of the following criteria (Ontario Regulation 9/06):

1. The property has design value or physical value because it,
 - a. is a rare, unique, representative or early example of a style, type, expression, material or construction method,
 - b. displays a high degree of craftsmanship or artistic merit, or
 - c. demonstrates a high degree of technical or scientific achievement.
2. The property has historical value or associative value because it,
 - a. has direct associations with a theme, event, belief, person, activity, organization or institution that is significant to a community,
 - b. yields, or has the potential to yield, information that contributes to an understanding of the community or culture, or
 - c. demonstrates or reflects the works or ideas of an architect, artist, builder, designer or theorist who is significant to a community.
3. The property has contextual value because it,
 - a. is important in defining, maintaining or supporting the character of an area,
 - b. is physically, functionally, visually or historically linked to its surrounding, or
 - c. is a landmark.

When putting forward a property for designation under the Ontario Heritage Act, there are four pieces of information required under O. Reg 385/21 and they are:

- Description of the portion of the property that has cultural heritage value or interest by way of site plan, scaled drawing or a description in writing;
- Statement of cultural value or interest which must identify and explain which of the designation criteria within O. Reg 9/06 is met;
- Description of heritage attributes which must explain how each heritage attribute contributes to the cultural heritage value or interest of the property; and
- Property identifier which includes the legal description, municipal address and general description of where the property is location (name of the neighbourhood/ward or closest major intersection).

Designation Process

There are seven steps to designating an individual property under Part IV of the Ontario Heritage Act. These steps are:

1. Identifying a property as a candidate for designation
2. Researching and evaluating the property
3. Serving the notice of intention to designate, with an opportunity for objection
4. Passing the designation by-law
5. Appeals and coming into force
6. Listing the property on the municipal register
7. Including property on the Ontario Heritage Trust register

Prior to designating a property under the Ontario Heritage Act, Council must pass a motion to proceed to designate the property. Council must also notify the property owner and the Ontario Heritage Trust and the Notice of Intent to designate must be published in a local newspaper. There is a 30-day objection period. If no objections to the Notice of Intent to designate are received after 30 days, Council may proceed to pass a by-law designating the property.

In 2019, through Bill 108, the More Homes, More Choices Act, amendments to the Ontario Heritage Act introduced a new review process for municipal Councils where there are objections to designation. It is now required that if a Notice of Objection is received within 30 days of the publishing of the Intent to Designate, the Council of the municipality shall consider the objection and make a decision whether or not to withdraw the Notice of Intention to designate the property within 90 days after the 30-day objection period. Should Council withdraw the Notice of Intent to designate or fail to make a decision in 90 days Notice of Withdraw is to be issued. If no objections are received or Council wishes to proceed with the Intent to Designate despite an objection, Council has 120 days from the date of the publication of the Notice of Intent to designate to pass the designation by-law. If Council fails to pass the by-law, the Notice of Intent to designate is deemed to be withdrawn and the municipality shall issue a

Notice of Withdrawal. Should Council pass a designation by-law notice is required to be published in the newspaper, given to the owner and the Ontario Trust.

Appeal process

Any person who objects to the by-law may appeal to the Ontario Land Tribunal in accordance with the Ontario Heritage Act, as amended within 30 days of the publication of the designation in the newspaper.

Statement of Cultural Value or Interest (prepared by Heritage Stratford)

The Avon Crest property municipally addressed 86 and 90 John Street South is comprised of an accumulation of late 19th century early 20th century health care buildings and a tree-lined semi-circular approach. The site is nearby the T.J. Dolan natural area and is a significant surviving example of a health care facility that testifies to the history of the medical and nursing professions in Canada. The Avon Crest is a well-known local landmark that provided a high standard of care demonstrating Stratford's commitment to its citizens well-being, which during the 19th century set Stratford apart as a settlement area and was a key component in shaping Stratford and attracting additional development in Stratford since its construction.

The overall site, including the tree-lined semi-circular drive and buildings, represents one of the best-preserved 19th century examples in Canada of how medicine was practiced, citizens served, and nurses housed and trained. The rectangular yellow-brick, three storey symmetrical Avon Crest building with central entry, with bay windows and open-air porches providing fresh air to convalescing patients, and punctuated by numerous chimneys exemplify the picturesque Queen Anne style as practiced by George F. Durand a well known Architect in Stratford and across southwestern Ontario. The tree-lined, semi-circular landscaped entrance has allowed the site to retain its 19th century context of how the site was accessed, used, and experienced during that time period.

The Avon Crest hospital has been an important medical facility and cultural feature for Stratford and Perth County, touching the lives of residents, in joy and in sadness, for over 130 years. Its yellow-brick, symmetrical plan, with bay windows and open-air porches represent Durand's skill as an architect and the historic role of hospital buildings to health care provision in Canada. The Avon Crest site has been an integral part of the overall culture, heritage and development of Stratford.

Description of Heritage Attributes (prepared by Heritage Stratford)

The specific heritage attributes of the property are:

1. Original 1891 hospital (Avon Crest)

- a. Intact massing, including 3-storey centre block with projecting entrance bay, framed by 3-storey gabled bays with projecting 2-storey bay windows.
 - b. Original yellow, stretcher bond brickwork.
 - c. Original rough stone basement foundation.
 - d. Original carved stone panel over entrance with buildings name (Stratford Hospital).
 - e. Original windows including:
 - i. Paired, arched windows with stone sills at 2nd floor over entrance and at 3rd floor over bay windows;
 - ii. Single windows with 4-over-4 overlights;
 - iii. 6- pane bay windows with overlights in projecting bays; and
 - iv. Projecting 3rd floor dormer windows, with 3-over- 3 overlights two on the principal façade and one each on the east and west roof.
 - f. Original ornamental brickwork at 3rd storey of the gabled ends and turrets of side bays.
2. Original 1910 north extension to the original 1891 hospital
- a. Intact massing;
 - b. Original yellow, stretcher bond brickwork;
 - c. 2-storey glazed solariums (originally open-air) at the west end;
 - d. Original interior layout
3. Tree lined semi-circular entrance driveway
4. 1904 Gardener's cottage
- a. Intact massing;
 - b. Original yellow, stretcher bond brickwork; and
 - c. Decorative, painted bargeboards at gabled ends of roof.
5. Original 1929 nurses' residence
- a. Intact massing

- b. Original, mid-brown brickwork; and
- c. Original, eyebrow dormer windows in roof.

Compliance with Designation Criteria (prepared by Heritage Stratford)

The heritage attributes listed above (1-5) meet the following sections of the Provincial criteria set out in Ontario Regulation 9/06:

1. The property has design value or physical value because it,
 - a. is a rare, unique, representative or early example of a style, type, expression, material or construction method. Specifically, Avon Crest is significant for the history of architecture in Canada. Few intact examples of 19th century hospitals remain.
2. The property has historical value or associative value because it,
 - a. has direct associations with a theme, event, belief, person, activity, organization or institution that is significant to a community. Specifically, Avon Crest is an important surviving example that testifies to the history of the medical and nursing professions in Canada.
 - a. demonstrates or reflects the works or ideas of an architect, artist, builder, designer or theorist who is significant to a community. Specifically, Avon Crest is an important example of the work of architect George F. Durand in Stratford, and across Southwestern Ontario.
3. The property has contextual value because it,
 - a. is a landmark. Specifically, Avon Crest has been a recognizable and defining feature of Stratford for over 130 years and represents a significant turning point in Stratford's commitment to caring for its citizens.

The heritage attributes (1-5) also meet the following criteria outlined within Section 3.5.3 i) of the Stratford Official Plan:

- a) prehistoric and historical associations with a theme of human history that is representative of cultural processes in the settlement, development and use of land in the City. Specifically, the establishment of a facility that provided a high standard of health care, which during the 19th century set Stratford apart as a settlement area and was a key component in shaping Stratford and attracting additional development.
- b) prehistoric and historical associations with the life and activities of a person, group, institution or organization that has made a significant contribution to the City. Specifically, the nurses, physicians and other health professionals who lived and

worked there over many years, and as a repository of personal memory and collective social meaning for the community.

- c) architectural, engineering, landscape design, physical, craft and/or artistic value. Specifically, the yellow-brick, Queen Anne-style Avon Crest building, with bay windows and open-air porches as representative of historical style. The tree lined semi-circular driveway represents the 19th century context of how the site was accessed and used during that time period.
- d) landmark value. Specifically, preserving the physical evidence of the Avon Crest Hospital, which has been a recognizable and defining feature of Stratford for over 130 years and represents a significant turning point in Stratford's commitment to caring for its citizens.

Public Comments

A written submission was received from a member of the public in December 2021, requesting that council supports Heritage Stratford's request to designate the Avon Crest site under Part IV of the Ontario Heritage Act to ensure the protection of the original 1891 hospital, 1910 extension, Gardener's cottage (1904), nurses' residence (1929), and the semi-circular landscaped entrance driveway, from possible destruction. The HPHA issued a Request for Solutions (RFS) in 2020 that instructed candidates that "careful demolition of the existing building must be considered". HPHA is the custodian of a significant piece of Stratford's historical and cultural heritage and for this too it is responsible to protect this heritage resource. The development of the site should incorporate preservation (which is the most environmentally sustainable solution). With creativity, ingenuity and determination the community can continue to enjoy and celebrate this unique example of Stratford's architectural and cultural history.

If Council does pass a motion to issue the intention to designate, all responses received will be submitted to Council for consideration.

Owner's Comments

Staff contacted the owners of the lands in November 2021 to discuss the Heritage Stratford motion. The proposed statement of cultural value or interest and description of the heritage attributes was passed along to the owner in December 2021. The owners advised that they object to designation under Part IV of the Ontario Heritage Act. Correspondence outlining the specific concerns is attached.

Photographs of 86 and 90 John Street South

Avon Crest, Principal Entrance Façade



Avon Crest, Principal Entrance Façade and 1910 Addition, From the West



Avon Crest, Principal Entrance Façade and 1910 Addition, From the East



Semi- circular Driveway



Nurses' Residence



Gardener's Cottage



Financial Implications:

Other:

There are no direct Financial Implications as a result of Heritage's Stratford recommendation to designate the subject property under Part IV of the Ontario Heritage Act.

Cost of the plaque and photography for the designation is within the existing Heritage Stratford budget.

If Council directs staff to issue the Notice of Intent to designate and an objection is received staff will seek direction from Council on how to proceed and will provide detailed information about the cost associated with an appeal.

Alignment with Strategic Priorities:

Strengthening our Plans, Strategies and Partnerships

Partnering with the community to make plans for our collective priorities in arts, culture, heritage and more. Communicating clearly with the public around our plans and activities.

Alignment with One Planet Principles:

Culture and Community

Nurturing local identity and heritage, empowering communities and promoting a culture of sustainable living.

Staff Recommendation: THAT Council consider the request from Heritage Stratford to adopt the following motion, as Heritage Stratford has adequately demonstrated that the heritage attributes of the site meets one or more of the provincial designation criteria set out in Ontario Regulation 9/06:

“THAT Council issue an intent to designate 86 & 90 John Street South under Part IV, Section 29 of the Ontario Heritage Act specifically the:

- a) 1891 hospital (Avon Crest), including the semi-circular landscaped entrance driveway;**
- b) 1910 extension;**
- c) 1904 Gardener’s cottage; and**
- d) 1929 Nurses’ residence.”**

Prepared by:

Recommended by:

Alyssa Bridge, MCIP, RPP, Manager of Planning

Taylor Crinklaw, Director of Infrastructure & Development Services

Joan Thomson, Chief Administrative Officer